

## A "Lawyerly" Note about the Materials

- 34 CFR $106.45(\mathrm{~b})(10)(\mathrm{D})$ requires that all materials used to train Title IX Coordinators, investigators, decision-makers, and informal resolution facilitators be publicly available on the recipient's website.
- These materials have been developed by ELPO Law and are proprietary and copyrighted. No third party is authorized or permitted to copy of use them.
- These materials have been developed for training purposes only.
> We are not giving legal advice.
> Consult with your legal counsel regarding how best to address a specific situation.

| Title IX Training Components Required Pursuant to 34 CFR §106.45 | - All members of the Title IX team must receive training on the following: |
| :---: | :---: |
|  | $\checkmark$ Definition of sexual harassment |
|  | Scope of recipient's education program or activity |
|  | $\checkmark$ How to conduct an investigation |
|  | The grievance process including hearings, appeals, and informal resolution processes, as applicable |
|  | How to serve impartially, including the avoidance of prejudgment of the facts at issue, conflicts of interest and bias |
|  | Issues of relevance of questions and evidence (including when questions and evidence about a complainant's sexual predisposition or prior sexual behavior are not relevant) |
|  | Issues of relevance to create an investigative report that fairly summarizes relevant evidence |
|  | Strength Knowedge Esperierce $\mid$ ELPO |

"No person in the United States shall, on the basis of sex, be excluded from participation in, be denied the benefits of, or be subjected to discrimination under any education program or activity receiving Federal financial assistance."

Title IX of the Education Amendments of 1972

## Title IX Nondiscrimination Mandate

Cannon v. University of Chicago, 441 U.S. 677 (1979)

To avoid the use of federal resources to support discriminatory practices

To provide individual citizens effective protection against those practices


## History of Title IX




## Two Avenues of Enforcement

- Administrative enforcement by agencies that disburse federal financial assistance to recipients
- Judicial enforcement by courts in private litigation


## Gebser v. Lago Vista Indep. Sch. Dist., 524 U.S. 274 (1998)

- Supreme Court determined conditions under which a school district will be liable for money damages for an employee sexually harassing a student
- School district violates Title IX when it has actual knowledge of the harassment but responds with deliberate indifference

Davis v. Monroe Co. Bd. of Educ., 526 U.S. 629 (1999)

- Supreme Court determined conditions under which a school district will be liable for money damages for a student sexually harassing another student
- Same standards of actual knowledge and deliberate indifference apply
- Supreme Court also defined sexual harassment to mean conduct so severe, pervasive, and objectively offensive that it denies its victims equal access to education


## U.S. Supreme Court Cases

## Gebser / Davis Framework

- Actionable sexual harassment
- Actual knowledge
- Deliberate indifference liability standard
U.S. Supreme Court Cases

© 2020 English, Lucas, Priest \& Owsley, LLP. All rights reserved.
- Certified
> Policy: 03.1621-Title IX Sexual Harassment
> Procedures: refer to Student Procedures
- Classified
> Policy: 03.2621-Title IX Sexual Harassment
> Procedures: refer to Student Procedures
- Student
> Policy: 09.428111-Title IX Sexual Harassment
> Procedures:
* 09.428111 AP. 1 - Notice to Individuals Regarding Title IX Sexual Harassment/ Discrimination
* 09.428111AP. 11 Grievance Procedures
* 09.428111AP.21Reporting Form


## The Title IX Team



ELP©



## Notification Requirements



| Accessible <br> Reporting to <br> Title IX | Schools Must Notify |
| :---: | :---: |
| CoordinatorThe following must be notified <br> of the name or title, office <br> address, e-mail address, and <br> telephone number of the Title <br> IX Coordinator: |  |
|  | $>$Applicants for admission <br> and employment |
| Notification <br> Requirements | Parents or legal guardians <br> of elementary and <br> secondary school students <br> $>$ |
|  | All unions |

## The Notice

Accessible Reporting to

Title IX Coordinator

Notification Requirements

- The notice must provide that:
> The district does not discriminate on the basis of sex in the education program or activity that it operates;
> The district is required by Title IX and the Title IX regulations not to discriminate in such a manner;
$>$ The requirement not to discriminate in the education program or activity extends to admissions and employment; and
> Application of Title IX and the Title IX regulations may be referred to the Title IX Coordinator, the Assistant Secretary, or both.

Accessible Reporting to Title IX Coordinator

Notification Requirements

- Schools must prominently display on their websites:
> The required contact information for the Title IX Coordinator
> The district's Title IX sexual harassment policy.
- This information must also be included in each handbook or catalog made available to those entitled to notice.
- Title IX training materials must be posted on school websites.

Strength, Knowledge, Experience. $\mid$ LLP®

Setice te Individual Rezarding Title IX Sexual Harasument/Discrimination

 ollectrve bugrining of refertional agwenent.
Die Ditaicr: Tele EX Coonlinuter (TDXC) is
Adken

## Cing. Stusc. 2 ip

Tmait Adtics
Totehtur Nimber
Any pervea mayy report ser dostimination. inclaliog sexual hurwunent fobiether or ont the



 having nop-bviness hourn) by uning the telephese mumber or clectronic mail adbest, of by mail po the office addesc. listed for the TIXC
The District mant porninendy diyloy the ceotset infirmation nepired to be lived for be TDXC nol Policies 03113, 03.212 Equal Emplopmeat Oppornaity. 00.13 Equal Edocatioal

 makes wailatie to pernoss kntided to a botuficatios huted sbove.


 servise. conflist of meterest, mad bise thadend.
The Distrist ment make these triining materials publicly movilable on its sobvite. or if tor
 enpest for ianpection by mamben of tie public.
RUTEMET:
 k+umb Poticies
05.113:03.1621:03.212:03.2621: 00.313:09. 228111

KLLATED PKOCEDEKES
$01621: 012021$ (all pocelwes)
09.428111 (elll procetares)

Certified, Classified \& Students

| CITATION | SUMMARY |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 106.45(a) | School's treatment of parties may constitute discrimination |  |  |
| 106.45(b)(1)(i)-(x) | Grievance Process Requirements |  |  |
| 106.45(b)(2) | Written Notice of Allegations to Both Parties |  |  |
| 106.45(b)(3)-(b)(4) | Formal Complaints Must be Investigated, Dismissals, Consolidation |  |  |
| 106.45(b)(5)(i)-(vii) | Investigation Requirements |  |  |
| 106.45(b)(6) | Cross Examination Conducted by Advisor |  |  |
| 106.45(b)(7) | Independent/Neutral Decision-maker, Standard of Evidence Same, Written Determination |  |  |
| 106.45(b)(8) | Appeals: Procedural Irregularities, New Evidence, Bias or Conflict of Interest |  |  |
| 106.45(b)(9) | Informal Resolution: Voluntary, Written Consent, Not Allowed for Employee Respondent |  |  |
| 106.45(b)(10) | Record Keeping, Publication of Training Materials |  |  |
| Procedural protections |  |  |  |
|  | Al rits reeved | Strength, Knowledge Experience. | ELPO |

## Definitions

## Complainant

## An individual who is alleged to be the victim of conduct that could constitute sexual harassment

## Respondent

An individual who has been reported to be the perpetrator of conduct that could constitute sexual harassment

* Student reports to guidance counselor that she is being sexually harassed by another student.
* Teacher witnesses another teacher and student kissing in the other teacher's classroom and tells the Principal.
* Mother of student under 18 reports to the Title IX Coordinator that her son is being sexually harassed by other students on the bus.
* After reporting sexual harassment to the Title IX Coordinator, student decides she does not want her complaint investigated, and the Title IX Coordinator moves forward with a sexual harassment investigation.


## Identifying the Complainant

Examples to Consider

## Complainant and Respondent

Applies to parties in both reports and formal complaints of sexual harassment

Complainant: A person who is alleged to be the victim of conduct that could constitute sexual harassment

NOT third party reporter
NOT Title IX Coordinator who "signs" complaint

Respondent: A person who has been reported to be the perpetrator of conduct that could constitute sexual harassment

## Actual Knowledge Triggers District's Duty to Respond

Examples to Consider

One evening after school, the Title IX Coordinator drives to the high school to retrieve an item he had left there earlier in the day. As he is exiting the building, he sees a teacher and student in the teacher's car kissing.

## Actual Knowledge?

- What if the person who sees the conduct is the Superintendent?
- A teacher?
- The basketball coach who is not otherwise employed by the District?
- What if the complaint is anonymous and is sent to the Superintendent through the mail?

Strength Knowedge Eperience ELP©

## Actual Knowledge

Notice of sexual harassment or allegations of sexual harassment to:

- A recipient's Title IX Coordinator
- Any official of the recipient who has authority to institute corrective measures on behalf of the recipient; or
- To any employee of an elementary and secondary school.
**Standard not met when the only official with actual knowledge is the respondent.


© 2020 English, Lucas, Priest \& Owsley, LLP. All rights reserved.


## Definition of Sexual Harassment

Title IX Rule § 106.30(a)

- The Rule's definition of sexual harassment has three components.
"Sexual harassment" means conduct on the basis of sex that satisfies one or more of the following:"

1) Quid pro quo harassment
2) Harassment pursuant to the Supreme Court's Davis v. Monroe Co. Bd. of Ed. opinion
3) Crimes under the Violence Against Women Act (VAWA) and the Clery Act

## Definition of Sexual Harassment

Quid Pro Quo

Davis Standard

Clery and VAWA Crimes

- An employee conditions something of value for a sexual favor
- Conduct that is so severe, pervasive, AND objectively offensive that denies equal access
- Sexual Assault, Stalking, Dating and Domestic Violence

Definition of
Sexual Harassment

Scenario to Ponder

Female student at the middle school "butt slaps" a male student.

Is this behavior sexual harassment under Title IX that warrants an investigation?

## Three Components of Sexual Harassment Definition

1) An employee of the recipient conditioning the provision of an aid, benefit, or service of the recipient on an individual's participation in unwelcome sexual conduct;
2) Unwelcome conduct determined by a reasonable person to be so severe, pervasive, and objectively offensive that it effectively denies a person equal access to the recipient's education program or activity; or
3) "Sexual assault" as defined in 20 U.S.C. 1092(f)(6)(A)(v), "dating violence" as defined in 34 U.S.C. 12291(a)(10), "domestic violence" as defined in 34 U.S.C. 12291(a)(8), or "stalking" as defined in 34 U.S.C. 12291(a)(30).

## Quid Pro Quo Sexual Harassment

- Applies only to an employee respondent
- Involves an abuse of authority over another employee or student
- Does not require a showing of severity, pervasiveness or offensiveness
- May involve implied conduct (need not be explicit)



## Quid Pro Quo Sexual Harassment

## Examples to

Consider

- The custodial supervisor tells a night custodian he will consider her for a day shift position if she will go to dinner with him.
- Susie, the smartest girl in $11^{\text {th }}$
 grade, tells John she will write his term paper for him if he will date her.
- The Finance Officer asks the payroll clerk to give him a shoulder massage and further comments that if she "plays her
 cards right," she can expect to have extended days added to her contract.
- John's hours were reduced after he refused the sexual advances of his supervisor.


## Sexual Harassment - Davis Standard

- Evaluated under a "reasonable person" standard that takes into consideration a constellation of facts, including ages of the parties involved, disability status, and positions of authority of the involved parties
- Can involve verbal, nonverbal, or physical conduct
- Must be severe, pervasive, and objectively offensive
> Involves the denial of equal access to education as compared to access of person not subjected to sexual harassment


## Words from OCR....

- Only serious situations will be actionable
- Not every instance of subjectively unwelcome conduct meets the sexual harassment definition under Davis standard
- Behavior that does not meet the definition of sexual harassment may still be addressed under other district policies and procedures


## Denial of Equal Access

- Total exclusion of access not required
- Denial is measured against the access of a person who has not been subjected to sexual harassment
- Examples
$>3^{\text {rd }}$ grader who starts bedwetting or crying at night
$>$ High school wrestler who quits team but carries on with other school activities
> Skipping class to avoid harasser
$>$ Decline in student's grade point average
$>$ Difficulty concentrating in class






## Sexual Assault

- Includes any sexual act directed against another person without their consent
> Rape
> Sodomy
$>$ Sexual assault with an object
> Fondling (touching private body parts without consent for the purpose of sexual gratification)
> Incest
> Statutory rape


## * The Rules do not provide a definition of consent.

* Schools must adopt a definition of consent.


## No

Consent

## Definition of Consent

Title IX Sexual Harassment Policy
03.1621 / 03.2621 / 09.428111
"Consent means a voluntary expression of willingness, permission, or agreement to engage in sexual activity throughout a sexual encounter. Consent cannot be granted by an individual: who is less than the statutory age of consent under Kentucky criminal law, has a mental or physical condition or incapacity that prevents the giving of consent; or from whom ostensible "consent" is extracted through threat, coercion, or forcible compulsion."

## Revisit "butt slapping" scenario by female student toward male student at the middle school



Consent

## Per OCR -

 "Where the touching of a person's private body part occurs for the purpose of sexual gratification, that offense warrants inclusion as sexual assault."

## Formal Complaint

- A formal complaint may be filed with the Title IX Coordinator
$>$ In person
> By mail

> By electronic mail using the contact info required to be listed for the Coordinator under § 106.8(a)
> By any additional method designated by the recipient


## Formal Complaint

- At the time of the filing, a complainant must be participating in or attempting to participate in the education program or activity of the recipient with which the formal complaint is filed.


## Formal Complaint

- Must almost always be signed by complainant
- Must allege sexual harassment against a respondent and request an investigation
- No requirement of a detailed statement of facts
- District can have actual notice of sexual harassment without a formal complaint
- Title IX Coordinator has discretion to sign formal complaint and initiate the district's grievance process when the Title IX Coordinator believes doing so is necessary to avoid being deliberately indifferent.


# What if an alleged victim does not want to file a complaint? 

When deciding whether to "sign" a formal complaint, the Title IX Coordinator should consider:

- Pattern of alleged conduct, especially by person with authority
- Involvement of violence, weapons, etc.
- Seriousness of alleged conduct
- Age of student harassed

Decision to sign a Formal Complaint, or not, reviewed for "deliberate indifference"

- Can a third party file a formal complaint for a friend?
- Can an anonymous report constitute a formal complaint?
- Can a parent file a formal complaint on behalf of their child?
- Can a complainant file a formal complaint by telephone?
- Does the complainant have to use the district's form?

Questions about the Formal Complaint


## Educational Program or Activity

## Definition

- Locations, events, or circumstances where the school exercises substantial control over both:
$>$ the Respondent
Title IX Rule $\quad>$ the context in which the alleged § 106.44 sexual harassment or discrimination occurs
- Includes any building owned or controlled by the school or by a student organization that is officially recognized by the school


## Jurisdictional Issue

- Fact specific inquiry
- If the alleged sexual harassment did not occur in the district's educational program or activity, Title IX does not apply.
- All on campus activities covered


## Off Campus Activities Covered If:

- Off-campus incident occurs as part of district's operations; or
- The District exercised substantial control over both the respondent and the context of the alleged sexual harassment that occurred off campus


## If Title IX does not apply, District can still act under its own code of conduct.

## Educational Program or Activity

# Educational Program or Activity Questions 

- What if some conduct occurs in the district's educational program or activity and some occurs outside the district's program or activity?
- What if a student uses a personal device (i.e. cell phone) to perpetrate online sexual harassment during class time?
- What if a student engages in online sexual harassment at home using a personal device?


## Supportive Measures

## Definition

Title IX Rule § 106.30(a)

- Non-disciplinary, non-punitive individualized services offered as appropriate, as reasonably available, and without fee or charge to the complainant or the respondent before or after the filing of a formal complaint or where no formal complaint has been filed
- Designed to restore or preserve equal access to the education program or activity without unreasonably burdening the other party
- May include the following:
$>$ Counseling
> Extensions of deadlines
> Other course-related adjustments
> Modifications of work or class schedules
$>$ School escort services
$>$ Mutual restrictions on contact between the parties
> Unilateral restrictions on contact that are not unreasonably burdensome on a respondent
> Changes in work locations
> Authorized leaves of absence
> Increased security and monitoring of certain areas of the district


## Supportive Measures

- Every complainant entitled to an offer of supportive measures by Title IX Coordinator upon report of sexual harassment
- KSBA Board Procedure also requires Title IX Coordinator to discuss possible supportive measures with respondent
- Formal complaint not required
- Cannot be designed to punish the respondent
- Must remain confidential unless disclosure needed to implement
- If district determines that a violation of Title IX did not occur, within discretion of district to continue supportive measures
- If supportive measures are not provided, the Title IX Coordinator must document the reasons why the failure was not clearly unreasonable in light of the known circumstances

© 2020 English, Lucas, Priest \& Owsley, LLP. All rights reserved.

Impartiality is vital to
the Title IX grievance process.


- Serving impartially includes the avoidance of the following:
> Prejudgment of the facts at issue $>$ Conflicts of interest > Bias
- BUT what does this mean? And how do you avoid them?


## Prejudgment of the Facts at Issue

- Prejudgment refers to passing judgment prematurely or without sufficient reflection or investigation
> Example: Complainant was crying while making her report. You conclude that because she was crying, she must have been telling the truth about the Respondent's conduct.
- Neither the Complainant who reports sexual harassment nor the Respondent defending those allegations should be prejudged.
- Sex stereotypes often lead to prejudgment.
> Example: Men cannot be sexually assaulted.
> Example: Women complaining about sexual harassment are just jumping on the \#MeToo bandwagon.

| How to <br> Avoid | - Keep an open mind <br> throughout the <br> process. |
| :--- | :--- |
| Prejudgment |  |
| of the Facts |  |$\quad$| - Wait to hear all of the |
| :--- |
| facts. |
| - Seek out additional |
| facts and/or witnesses |
| if you feel you are |
| jumping to |
| conclusions. |

# How to <br> Avoid <br> Prejudgment of the Facts 

- Consider potential responses to trauma
> Delayed or reluctant reporting
> Difficulty remembering details
> Being calm and composed after an assault
- Do not assume that because there are signs of trauma, the trauma was caused by the Respondent.
- Do not assume that because there are not signs of trauma that nothing bad happened.



## Conflicts of Interest

- A conflict of interest occurs when personal or private interests compromise one's judgment, decisions, or actions.
- Conflicts of interests can occur as a result of personal relationships (family, friends, faculty, civic organizations, etc.), financial investments, or other social factors.
- There are no per se conflicts of interests outlined in the Title IX regulations.
$>$ BUT there may exist the appearance of a conflict or a bias that prevents the investigator from serving.
- A conflict of interest that disqualifies you from the Title IX grievance process is one that prevents you from being able to impartially participate.
- Conflicts of interest can be actual, perceived, or potential.


## Conflicts of Interest

## Conflicts of Interest

- Actual conflict of interest - a direct conflict between your official duties and responsibilities and a competing personal interest or obligation.
> Example: The Title IX decision maker's daughter is the Complainant.
- Perceived conflict of interest - a situation where it could reasonably be perceived that a competing interest could improperly influence the performance of your official duties and responsibilities.
> Example: The Title IX investigator previously had relationship with a family member of the Respondent.
- Potential conflict of interest - arises where a personal interest or obligation may conflict with one's official duties and responsibilities in the future.
> Example: The Title IX Coordinator and Complainant are scheduled to co-chair an upcoming school event.


## Conflicts of Interest

- How do you determine if you have a conflict of interest? Ask yourself the following questions:
> Would I be happy if my colleagues became aware of the conflict?
$>$ Would I be happy if the conflict was discussed in the media or on Facebook or Twitter?
> If someone else was in my position, would I think he/she should be barred from participating?
> If I were the Complainant or the Respondent, would I want someone in my position to investigate the allegations?


## Bias

- A bias is a tendency, inclination, or prejudice towards or against someone.
> Often based on stereotypes, rather than actual knowledge of an individual or a particular circumstance
> Frequently based on a person's gender, race, or sexual orientation



## Examples of Bias

Example: When talking with Title IX Complainants, the Title IX Coordinator begins the initial interview by asking who the Respondent is and what "he" did to the Complainant (always assuming the Respondent is a male).

* Example: A Title IX Decisionmaker finds the Respondent more credible than the Complainant because the Respondent speaks "perfect English" while the Complainant, who only knows English as a second language, does not.
streath krow dode boseme |ELP©


## Avoiding Bias

- Let the evidence lead to the conclusion, not the other way around.
- Maintain documentation.
> Evaluate the source of the information, the content, and the plausibility in light of other evidence.
- Be thorough. Don't limit the investigation to either party's witnesses or evidence.


## The Initial Report



What must a school district do to respond?

A recipient with actual knowledge of sexual harassment in an education program or activity against a person in the United States must respond promptly and in a manner that is not deliberately indifferent.


Emergency
Removal/
Employee
Administrative
Leave

- Removal / leave can occur before an investigation into sexual harassment allegations concludes or where no grievance process is pending.
- The Superintendent directs the removal.



## Immediate Emergency Removal of Student

```
Based on an individualized safety or risk analysis (**See KSBA Policy
09.429 Threat Assessment)
```

To protect a student or other individual from immediate threat to physical health or safety

Notice, opportunity to challenge provided "immediately" after the removal (**See KSBA Policy 09.434 Suspension)

Can place burden of proof on Respondent to show removal decision was incorrect

Consider other laws, e.g., state laws, "change in placement" under IDEA

## Employee Administrative Leave

## Not prohibited

> KSBA Board Policies 03.173 (Certified) and 03.27 (Classified) allow for temporary suspension with pay while awaiting the outcome of a pending investigation

| Initial Meeting with Complainant | Contact | Upon receipt of actual knowledge, contact the complainant to discuss the availability of "supportive measures" |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Consider | Consider the complainant's wishes with respect to supportive measures |
| Title IX Coordinator must promptly, even if no formal complaint is filed.... | Inform | Inform the complainant of the availability of supportive measures with or without the filing of a formal complaint |
|  | Explain | Explain the process for filing a formal complaint |
|  | Strength, Knowledge, Eperience \|ELP® |  |

## The Formal Complaint



## Written Notice Regarding Formal Complaint

Upon receipt of a formal complaint and prior to any interviews, the Title IX Coordinator must provide the parties written notice of:
$\checkmark$ The district's grievance process, including any informal resolution process;
$\checkmark$ The allegations of sexual harassment;
$\checkmark$ The identity of the parties;
$\checkmark$ The conduct allegedly constituting sexual harassment;
$\checkmark$ The date and location of the incident;
$\checkmark$ The presumption of nonresponsibility until a determination has been made regarding responsibility at the end of the grievance process;
$\checkmark$ The right to inspect and review evidence;
$\checkmark$ The right to have an advisor during the process; and
$\checkmark$ Any provision in the district's code of conduct that prohibits knowingly making false statements or submitting false information during the grievance process.


## Confidentiality

- The District must keep confidential the identity of the following:
> Any individual who has made a report or complaint
> Any complainant, respondent, or witness
> Any individual who has been reported to be the perpetrator
- Exceptions
> Those permitted by FERPA, by law, or those needed to carry out Title IX purposes, including the conduct of any investigation, hearing or judicial proceeding

Title IX Sexual Harassment Policy
03.1621/03.2621/09.428111

## Confidentiality

- Investigative evidence directly related to the allegations of a formal complaint is subject to inspection and review by the parties
$>$ BUT is not to be disseminated to the public
> DOE rule commentary: In accordance with FERPA's definition of "education records," a parent of a complainant or a respondent (or eligible student) has a right to inspect and review any witness statement that is directly related to the student EVEN IF that statement contains information directly related to another student IF the information cannot be segregated or redacted without destroying its meaning.

Titte IX Sexual Harassment Policy
03.1621/03.2621/09.428111

> A single teacher brings a complaint against a married administrator alleging learing, glaring, comments about short skirts, etc. There is also an underlying rumor about a physical sexual relationship. The investigation has begun with an interview of the Respondent, and the Complainant has now written an e-mail to the superintendent withdrawing her complaint.

## Dismissal of Formal Complaint

- The Title IX Coordinator must dismiss a formal complaint if:
> The conduct alleged does not meet the definition of sexual harassment; or
> The conduct alleged did not occur within the scope of the district's educational programs and activities; or
> The conduct did not occur in the United States
- If a formal complaint is dismissed, the Title IX Coordinator must provide written notice to the parties explaining the reasons.
- The parties can appeal any dismissal.


## Dismissal of Formal Complaint

- The Title IX Coordinator may dismiss a formal complaint if:
> A Complainant withdraws the complaint; or
> The Respondent is no longer employed or enrolled in the district; or
> There are specific circumstances that prevent the district from gathering evidence sufficient to reach a determination.


## The Investigation

Reasonably Prompt Time Frames

Time frames for grievance process must be reasonably prompt, including appeals and internal resolution process

- The investigation shall be concluded within 40 calendar days from the date of the notice to the parties following a formal complaint
> Initial Interviews of the Parties: Not less than 10 calendar days from the date of the notice to the parties following a formal complaint
>Parties Raise Conflict of Interest or Bias Concerns regarding Investigator: 3 calendar days from the date of the notice to the parties following a formal complaint
$>$ Written Response Regarding Evidence: 10 calendar days
$>$ Written Response to Investigative Report: 10 calendar days

|  | Pre-Determination Matters |
| :---: | :---: |
| Reasonably Prompt Time Frames | > Written Questions a Party Wants Decision Maker to Ask Other Party or Witness: 5 calendar days from date Decision Maker Received Investigative Report |
| Time frames for grievance process must be reasonably prompt, including appeals and internal resolution process | Follow-Up Questions: 5 calendar days to submit written follow-up questions after reviewing the responses of the other party and/or witness |

- Determination of Responsibility: issued by the Decision Maker within 30 calendar days of receipt of the Investigator's report
- Written Appeal: Filed within 5 calendar days of receipt of the determination decision
- Written Response to Appeal: 5 calendar days upon receipt of notification by the Appellate Decision Maker of a party's appeal

Reasonably Prompt Time Frames
The Determination and Appeals

## Reasonably Prompt Time Frames

- Limited extensions permitted only for good cause
- A concurrent criminal investigation does not alleviate Title IX investigating requirements but could support short delay
- Must try to accommodate schedules of parties or witnesses but they cannot indefinitely delay the grievance process by failing to cooperate


## Conducting the Investigation



## Evidentiary Standards



## Standard of Evidence

Districts must adopt a standard of evidence:
$\square$ Preponderance of the evidence $=$ concluding that a fact is more likely than not to be true
$\square$ Clear and convincing evidence $=$


Must use the same standard of evidence for all complaints against students and employees


## Statute of Limitations - Example

When Jane was in $7^{\text {th }}$ grade she was subjected to severe sexual harassment by several boys on the bus which included unwanted verbal taunts and grabbing her body. She never reported their behavior. Jane is now in $11^{\text {th }}$ grade and is aware of the Me Too Movement. She decides to tell her high school guidance counselor about what happened and wants the boys punished.

> Is Jane's report too late?

How far back must the district go to fulfill its Title IX obligations?

## Burden of Proof

- The burden of gathering evidence and the burden of proof remains on the district throughout the grievance process
- Both parties have the right to provide evidence and witnesses but not required
- The district bears the responsibility of gathering evidence and interviewing witnesses
- The district is neutral during the investigative process
- Goal of the investigation is to gather information so the neutral decision maker can make an accurate determination


## The Parties' Rights

- Notice and opportunity to prepare
- Right to an advisor
- Opportunity to present evidence (documentation and witnesses)
- Cannot restrict the parties' right to discuss the allegations with others
- Right to review all evidence directly related to the investigation
- Right to review the Investigative Report


## Notice and Opportunity to Prepare

Title IX Rule
§ 106.45(b)(5)(v)
"When investigating a formal complaint and throughout the grievance process...a recipient must provide, to a party whose participation is invited or expected, written notice of the date, time, location, participants, and purpose of all hearings, investigative interviews, or other meetings, with sufficient time for the party to prepare to participate...."

| Right to an Advisor <br> Title IX Rule §106.45(b)(5)(iv) | - The parties shall have the same opportunity to have an advisor of his/her choice <br> - Advisor can be anyone attorney, friend, parent, another student <br> - The role of the advisor is to provide support and to accompany the party to meetings and interviews <br> - The district can establish restrictions regarding the extent to which the advisor can participate in the proceedings BUT any restrictions must apply equally to both parties |
| :---: | :---: |
| manerecomy |  |



- The district cannot restrict the parties from discussing the
Right to Discuss the Allegations
Title IX Rule § 106.45(b)(5)(iii) allegations or from gathering evidence.
$>$ No confidentiality or gag orders
- Some limited exceptions
> No-contact directive
> Purpose cannot be retaliatory


integrate


## The Investigation <br> *. Develop an investigation plan

Develop Gather Conduct Provide

* Gather all relevant evidence

Conduct interviews

Provide evidence to parties and prepare final Investigative Report and recommendation

## Investigation Plan

- Determine the scope of the investigation
- Prepare a chronology of known events with respect to the allegations
- Identify important witnesses to be interviewed and develop a preliminary schedule of interviews
- Identify relevant evidence to be obtained



## Conducting Interviews



# Interviews of the Parties <br> and Witnesses 

- Determine where to conduct the interviews
> Private location where parties and witnesses will be comfortable
- Explain the investigation process
> Give expected time frame for completion of investigation
> Explain what details might be shared with others
- Cover the district's prohibition on retaliation


## Interviews of the Parties and Witnesses

Do's and

Don'ts

DON'T: Be too formal
DO: Show empathy while
maintaining a professional objectivity
********
DON'T: Refuse to ask a particular question because it may be
embarrassing or because it may make you or the witness uncomfortable

DO: Ask questions in a tactful manner in order to obtain all the necessary details

Interviews of the Parties
and Witnesses

Do's and Don'ts

DON'T: Ask questions based on what you think might have happened
DO: Ask open-ended questions to obtain the facts and then follow up to clarify the details
********
DON'T: Interrupt the witness or make assumptions
DO: Allow the witness time to tell his/her story

## Interviews of the Parties <br> and Witnesses

Do's and
Don'ts

DON'T: Act like a detective on Law \& Order and treat the interview like an interrogation

DO: Remember your role as an investigator and remain objective
********
DON'T: Allow unconscious bias or your personal beliefs to erode your objectivity
DO: Continually remind yourself to keep an open mind and gather all the evidence.

## The Evidence



## Evidence

- The district carries the burden of proof.
- The Investigator must collect all of the evidence related to the allegations and then evaluate the relevant evidence.
- Cannot exclude relevant evidence because it may be unduly prejudicial, concern prior bad acts, or constitute character evidence.
- Privileged evidence is not relevant without consent. - Attorney-client D Doctor-patient $~$ Spouse
- Medical and counseling records are not relevant without voluntary, written consent.
- Complainant's prior sexual behavior is not relevant with two exceptions.
- The parties have the right to inspect all the evidence (both related to and relevant).


# Evidence pertinent to proving whether facts material to the allegation are more or less likely to be true. 



Relevant Evidence



Before issuing the Investigative Report, the Investigator must provide the parties and advisors an opportunity to inspect and review the evidence.
> Evidence that is directly related to (both relevant and irrelevant) the allegations raised in the Formal Complaint
> Statements, notes of interviews, and other types of evidence the school plans to use before reaching a determination and evidence the school doesn't think it will use
> Provide the evidence in electronic or hard copy format
> Advise the parties that the evidence is not to be publicly disseminated
The parties must be given at least 10 calendar days to review all the evidence and submit written responses about the evidence to the investigator.
The Investigator must consider parties' input prior to completion of Investigative Report.

## The Investigative Report



| The Investigative Report | - The final investigative report must fairly summarize relevant evidence. |
| :---: | :---: |
|  | - Per KSBA Board procedure 09.428111 AP.11, must include the Investigator's recommendation on whether or not the evidence supports a finding that the Respondent engaged in conduct constituting Title IX sexual harassment. |
|  | $>$ But, the Decision Maker is under an independent obligation to objectively evaluate the relevant evidence and cannot defer to the Investigator's recommendations. |
|  | - Investigator must send the final investigative report to the parties and any advisors simultaneously for their review and written responses. |
|  | > Written responses to be filed within 10 calendar days of receipt of the report |
|  | Investigator must forward the Investigative Report and party responses to the assigned Decision Maker |
|  | Stergath Krowedge Eperierce \|ELP® |

## Determination Regarding Responsibility



## Opportunity of Parties to Submit Questions

- Prior to reaching a determination regarding responsibility, the Decision Maker
$>$ Must immediately inform the parties of the date he/she received the Investigative Report and give each party the opportunity to submit written, relevant questions that a party wants asked of any party or witness
> Must allow 5 calendar days
> Must provide each party with answers
> Must allow for additional, limited follow-up questions from each party within 5 calendar days from receiving the answers
> Must provide each party with follow-up answers
> Must explain to the party proposing the questions any decision to exclude a question as not relevant
- The Decision Maker must review the Investigative Report, the parties' responses and other written materials before issuing the determination.
- Preponderance of the evidence standard applies



## The Written Determination

Written Determination must include the following:
> Identification of the allegations potentially constituting sexual harassment;
> Description of the procedural steps taken from the receipt of the formal complaint through the determination, including any notifications to the parties, interviews with parties and witnesses, site visits, methods used to gather other evidence, and hearings held;
$>$ Findings of fact supporting the determination;
> Conclusions regarding the application of the district's code of conduct to the facts;
Title IX Rule § 106.45(b)(7)(ii)
> A statement of, and rationale for, the result as to each allegation, including a determination regarding responsibility, any disciplinary sanctions the district imposes on the Respondent, and whether remedies designed to restore or preserve equal access to the district's education program or activity will be provided by the district to the Complainant; and
$>$ The district's procedures and permissible bases for the Complainant and Respondent to appeal.

- Written Determination to be issued within 30 calendar days of the Decision Maker's receipt of the Investigative Report
> Reasonable extension for good cause allowed
- Decision Maker must provide determination to the parties simultaneously
- Determination becomes final when the district issues a written decision regarding any appeal or, if no appeal is filed, the date when an appeal would no longer be considered timely
* Required if the determination substantiates that sexual harassment occurred.
* Designed to restore or preserve equal access to the district's education program or activity.
* Nature of remedies being offered should not appear in the written determination of responsibility
* Title IX Coordinator responsible for effective implementation of remedies
* Can be same as supportive measures and can include other appropriate measures
* Need not be non-disciplinary or non-punitive and may burden the Respondent

Remedies

## Disciplinary Sanctions

Title IX Sexual Harassment Grievance Procedure
09.428111 AP. 11

- For students, the non-exhaustive range includes:
$>$ In or out of school suspension
$>$ Expulsion
> Assignment to alternative education programs
$>$ Requirement to engage in education or counseling program
$>$ Disqualification or modification of privileges to participate in sports or extracurricular programs
$>$ Unilateral no-contact orders
$>$ School assignment alteration or schedule changes
$>$ Prohibitions or limitations on presence on school property or at school-related events
$>$ Other disciplinary sanctions and interventions set forth in the district's code of conduct


## Disciplinary Sanctions

Title IX Sexual Harassment Grievance Procedure
09.428111 AP. 11

- For employees, the non-exhaustive range includes:
$>$ Requirement to engage in education or counseling program
> Unilateral no-contact orders
> School assignment alteration
$>$ Prohibitions or limitations on presence on school property or at school-related events

Private reprimand
> Public reprimand
Suspension without pay
> Termination

## Appeals



## Appeals

- Both parties have the right to appeal from a determination of responsibility and the decision to dismiss a formal complaint, on the following bases:
$>$ A procedural irregularity that affected the outcome
$>$ New evidence that could affect the outcome and that was not reasonably available at the time the determination or dismissal was made
> The Title IX Coordinator, Investigator, or Decision Maker had a conflict of interest or bias against complainants or respondents in general or against the specific Complainant or Respondent that affected the outcome


## Appeals

- An appeal must be filed within 5 calendar days of decision
- An appeal must be filed in writing with the Superintendent and state the grounds and arguments for reversal or modification of the decision
- The Superintendent may serve as the Appellate Decision Maker or submit the appeal to the designated Appellate Decision Maker.
- The Appellate Decision Maker must notify the other party in writing when an appeal is filed and include copies of the document setting forth the grounds and arguments in support of the appeal.
- The other party has the option of filing written arguments in response to the opposing party's appeal within 5 calendar days of the appeal document.

The Appellate Decision Maker must:
> Conduct an impartial review of the appeal including consideration of arguments of the parties and the
> Issue a written decision describing the result of the appeal and rationale for the result
$>$ Provide notice of the written decision simultaneously to the parties

The decision may:
$>$ Affirm the determination
> Reverse the determination
> Modify the determination in whole or in part

## Recordkeeping

Records related to sexual harassment reports and the complaint process must be maintained for a minimum of 7 years.


## Informal Resolution




- School has discretion to choose to offer and facilitate informal resolution process


## Not required

- IF informal resolution offered
> Can only be utilized when there is a formal complaint
$>$ Can be used so long as both parties voluntarily agree
> Informed, written consent required
- Process can be utilized any time prior to reaching a determination
- At any time before resolution, a party can withdraw from the informal process and resume the grievance process.
- School may not require a waiver of the right to a formal investigation.

The District may not require Informal Resolution...
As condition of enrollment or continuing enrollment;

As condition of employment or continuing employment; or

As condition of enjoyment of any other rights.

## Informal Resolution

## Informal Resolution - Considerations

- Cannot be used to resolve allegations that employee sexually harassed a student
- Avoid using in severe situations or with violent incidents
- Title IX Coordinator determines if the informal resolution process should be utilized > Remember: The parties must voluntarily agree to participate. The Title IX Coordinator cannot pressure a party to participate.


## Reasons to Consider Informal Resolution

- Parties may be more satisfied with outcomes they reach themselves
- Solutions are tailored to the parties' needs
- Process is less adversarial


| Types of | - Not defined in the regulations |
| :---: | :---: |
| Informal | - Purpose is to repair harm through facilitation |
| Restorative Justice | - Any requirement to admit responsibility? <br> - Supportive vs. Punitive |

- Acknowledgement of responsibility by a Respondent
- Apologies
- Disciplinary actions against a Respondent or a requirement to engage in specific services
- Supportive Measures

Other Examples of Informal Resolution Title IX Grievance Procedure 09.428111 AP. 11

## Requirements for Informal Resolution Process

KSBA Procedure 09.428111 AP. 11

- Both parties must voluntarily agree in writing.
- Either party can withdraw at any time.
- The Superintendent, or designee, must agree to the terms of the informal resolution reached by the parties.
- Any agreement reached must be signed by both parties and the District.
- The parties must be advised that engagement in the informal resolution process is grounds for an extension of the investigation timeline.


# - Create ground rules in writing - Utilize remote technology - Keep parties apart in mediation 

# Informal Resolution 

 Recommendations
## Retaliation



## Retaliation

Title IX Rule § 106.71

## Retaliation Prohibited

No recipient or other person may intimidate, threaten, coerce, or discriminate against any individual for the purpose of interfering with any right or privilege secured by Title IX, or because the individual has made a report or complaint, testified, assisted, or participated or refused to participate in any manner in an investigation, proceeding, or hearing....

## Retaliation



- Any reports of retaliation should be made immediately to the Title IX Coordinator.
- Retaliation complaints may be filed under Title IX grievance process.
- The exercise of First Amendment rights does not constitute retaliation.


## Retaliation

- Beware of disciplining for a non-harassment code of conduct violation where you learned of the violation via the sexual harassment complaint.
> It can be done, but should be for an infraction for which you typically would discipline.
> Someone other than the Investigator or the Decision Maker should process any such discipline and should know as little as possible about the Title IX Complaint.
- Disciplining a student based on a code of conduct violation for making a materially false statement in bad faith during the investigation of a complaint does not constitute retaliation.


